

Comparative study of *Sun Zi's "Art of War"* and *"on War"*

《孙子兵法》与《战争论》

比较研究



Professor Xia Yidong, NDU
国防大学 夏一东



一、两书的内容比较

I. A comparison of contents

二、两书的特征差异

II. A comparison of features



一、两书的内容比较

I. A comparison of contents



（一）在战争目的方面，“不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

A. In terms of the objectives of war, “to subdue the enemy without fighting” vs. “to annihilate the enemy’s troops”

（二）在作战手段方面，“兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

B. In terms of the operational means, “What is valued in war is a quick victory, not prolonged operations” vs. “offensive defense”

（三）在信息情报方面，“知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

C. In terms of information and intelligence, “know the enemy and know yourself” vs. “the friction of war”



(一) 在战争目的方面, “不战而屈人之兵” 与 “消灭敌人军队”

A. In terms of the objectives of war, “to subdue the enemy without fighting” vs. “to annihilate the enemy’s troops”



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

战争是迫使敌人服从我们意志的一种暴力行为。

War is an act of violence intended to compel our opponent to fulfill our will.

暴力Violence



胜利Victory

工具Tools



目的aim



一、“不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

孙子的战争目的观 Outlook of war by Sun Zi

- 实力是赢得战争胜利的基础 Real strength is the basis to ensure victory of war.
- 暴力的使用有利有弊 There are advantages and disadvantages in the use of violence.
- 不战而屈人之兵为最高目的 The ultimate purpose is to subdue the enemy without fighting.
- 谋攻是达成目的的主要方式 The main way to achieve the aim is “attack by stratagem” .



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

■ 实力是赢得战争胜利的基础 Real strength: basis of war victory

地生度，度生量，量生数，数生称，称生胜。故胜兵若以镒称铢，败兵若以铢称镒。
Measurement owes its existence to Earth; Estimation of quantity to Measurement; Calculation to Estimation of quantity; Balancing of chances to Calculation; and Victory to Balancing of chances. A victorious army opposed to a routed one, is as a pound's weight placed in the scale against a single grain.

| | |
|------|------------------|
| 国家幅员 | Territory |
| 耕地面积 | Arable land |
| 人口数量 | Population |
| 军队数量 | Size of military |





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

■ **暴力的使用有利有弊** There are advantages and disadvantages in the use of violence.

不尽知用兵之害者，则不能尽知用兵之利也。
It is only one who is thoroughly acquainted with the evils of war that can thoroughly understand the profitable way of carrying it on.

一是政治外交上会有不测

Firstly, there will be unexpected calamity in politics and foreign relations.

夫钝兵挫锐，屈力殫货，则诸侯乘其弊而起，虽有智者不能善其后矣。
when your weapons are dulled, your ardor damped, your strength exhausted and your treasure spent, other chieftains will spring up to take advantage of your extremity. Then no man, however wise, will be able to avert the consequences that must ensue.





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

二是经济财政上会逐渐枯竭

Secondly, finance and economy will decline and get drained gradually.

久暴师则国用不足

If the campaign is protracted, the resources of the State will not be equal to the strain.





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

三是伤亡大量人员

Thirdly, there will be heavy casualties.

将不胜其忿而蚁附之，杀士三分之一而城不拔。 The general, unable to control his irritation, will launch his men to the assault like swarming ants, with the result that one-third of his men are slain, while the town still remains untaken.





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

■ 不战而屈人之兵为最高目的 **The supreme excellence is to subdue the enemy without fighting.**

是故百战百胜非善之善者也，不战而屈人之兵，善之善者也。 *Hence to win one hundred victories in one hundred battles is not the acme of skill. To subdue the enemy without fighting is the supreme excellence.*

全国为上，破国次之；全军为上，破军次之；全旅为上，破旅次之；全卒为上，破卒次之；全伍为上，破伍次之。 *Generally in war the best thing of all is to take the enemy's state whole and intact, to ruin it is inferior to this. To capture the enemy's army entire is better than to destroy it; to take intact a battalion, a company or a five-man squad is better than to destroy them.*





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

■ 谋攻是达成目的的主要方式 The main way to realize the aim is to attack by stratagem.

兵者，诡道也。 All warfare is based on deception.

上兵伐谋 The best policy in war is to attack the enemy's strategy.

其次伐交 The second best way is to disrupt his alliances through diplomatic means.

其下伐兵 The next best method is to attack his army in the field.

其下攻城 The worst policy is to attack walled cities.





一、“不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

克劳塞维茨的战争目的观 Clausewitz's outlook on war



- 暴力是赢得战争胜利的关键
- Utmost use of force
- 暴力的使用越来越趋向无限
- An act of violence was pushed to its utmost bounds
- 以消灭敌人军队为主要目的
- Destruction of the enemy: aim of war
- 主力会战是达成目的的主要方式
- Battle is the main way to achieve the aim



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

■ 暴力是赢得战争胜利的关键 **Violence is the key to win.**

由于厌恶这个残暴的要素，而忽视它的性质，这是没有益处的，甚至是错误的。

If you neglect the element of violence simply because you dislike the features of it, it is not beneficial, even wrong.





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

战争就是杀人的买卖，你不放他的血，他就会宰了你。
划破对手的肚皮，要不就打穿他们的肠子。

War is a business of killing. If you don't bleed him, he will kill you. You have to carve your opponents' belly or break through their guts.

— George Smith Patton



巴顿



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

此刻，我得知美国完全陷入了战争，不彻底就不会脱身。因此，我们无论如何已经赢了！.....希特勒的命运被注定了。墨索里尼的命运被注定了。至于日本人，他们将被碾得粉碎。.....前面还有许多灾难、无可估量的代价和磨难，但关于结局没有更多的疑问。

At such moment, when I was informed that US was dragged into war thoroughly and we would not get away unless we won. Therefore, we have assured the victory. The fate of Hitler is doomed. The fate of Mussolini is doomed. As for the Japanese, they would be grinded to pieces. There will be many disasters, immeasurable costs and difficulties. But there is no doubt of the outcome.





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

| | 1942年 | 1940年—1945年 |
|------------------|-------------------------|------------------|
| 飞机 aircraft | 6万架 60,000 | 30万架 300,000 |
| 坦克 tank | 4.5万辆 45,000 | 86700辆 86,700 |
| 高炮 artillery | 4万门 40,000 | 12万门 120,000 |
| 商船 merchant ship | 800万吨 8 million tons | 5425艘 5425 |
| 军用舰船 warship | | 71000艘 71,000 |



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

■ 暴力的使用越来越趋向无限 **increasingly indefinite use of violence**

不顾一切、不惜流血地使用暴力的一方，在对方不这样做的时候，就必然会取得优势。

He who uses force unsparingly, without reference to the bloodshed involved, must obtain a superiority if his adversary uses less vigor in its application.





一、“不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

| 类别 战争 | 每次战役平均参战人数 Percentage participating personnel for each campaign | 十万人以上战役的次 数 Campaigns involving more than 100,000 |
|--------------------------|---|---|
| 七年战争 Seven years' war | 47000 | 12 |
| 拿破仑战争 Napoleonic wars | 84000 | 37 |

有限战争limited war



全面战争all-out war



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

在任何国家的法典中，再没有哪一种法律比这个不太著名的法国法案，对于人类的前途具有更大的影响。

No other codes would bring such great impact to the fate of mankind than the French conscription bill.



《征兵法案》
Conscription bill



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

■ 以消灭敌人军队为主要目的 **Destroying the enemy is the main aim.**

在战争所能追求的目的中，消灭敌人军队永远是最高的目的。

Among all the aims pursued in a war, the supreme aim is always to wipe out the enemy troops.





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

欧洲有很多优秀的将军，但他们一下期望的东西太多，而我只看一个东西：敌人的兵力，并且力图消灭他们，因为我相信，只要把军队全消灭，其他一切就会随之而土崩瓦解。

There are many excellent generals in Europe. But they always expect too much. But I only focus on one thing: the enemy forces. I am determined to wipe them out, as I believe that as long as the troops were destroyed, other things will collapse with it.

——拿破仑
Napoleon





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

主力会战是达成目的的主要方式 Battle is the main way to realize the aim.

必须永远把主力会战看作是战争的真正的重心。

Battles should always be regarded as the real gravity in a war .

主力会战是解决问题的最残酷的方法。

Battles are the cruelest method to solve problems.



滑铁卢战役场景



(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

| 孙子Sun Zi | 克劳塞维茨Clausewitz |
|------------------------|--------------------------|
| 实力 real strength | 暴力violence |
| 有限暴力limited violence | 无限暴力indefinite violence |
| 全胜 whole victory | 战胜 win victory by battle |
| 谋攻 attack by stratagem | 会战 battles |



(二) 在作战手段方面, “兵贵胜不贵久” 与 “攻势防御”
B. In terms of the operational means, “What is valued in war is a quick victory, not prolonged operations” vs. “offensive defense”



- 速战速决 quick victory
- 谋形造势 create favorable situation
- 先发制人 preemptive action
- 避实击虚 avoid the strong parts and attack the vulnerable parts



(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

■ 速战速决 quick victory

兵闻拙速，未睹巧之久也。

Though we have heard of stupid haste in war, cleverness has never been seen associated with long delays.

兵之情主速。

What is valued in war is quick victory.





(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

■ 谋形造势 create favorable situation

胜兵先胜而后求战，败兵先战而后求胜。

It follows that a triumphant army will not fight with the enemy until the victory is assured, while an army destined to defeat will always fight with his opponent first, in the hope that it may win by sheer good luck.

- 积蓄力量 accumulate strength
- 战略布局 strategic energy

若决积水于千仞之溪者，形也。 The onrush of a conquering force is like the bursting of pent-up waters into a chasm a thousand fathoms deep.

如转圆石于千仞之山者，势也。

The energy of troops skillfully commanded is just like the momentum of round stones quickly tumbling down from a mountain thousands of feet in height. This is what ‘use of energy’ means.





(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”



(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

■ 先发制人 preemptive action

先处战地而待敌者佚，
后处战地而趋战者劳。

*Generally, he who occupies the field of battle first
and awaits his enemy is at ease; he who arrives
later and joins battle in haste is weary.*





(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

■ 避实击虚 avoid the strong and strike the vulnerable

进攻而不可御者，冲其虚也。 *His offensive will be irresistible if he plunges into the enemy's weak points.*

出其所不趋，趋其所不意。行千里而不劳者，行于无人之地也。攻而必取者，攻取所不守也。 *All these can be done because you appear at points which the enemy must hasten to defend. That you may march a thousand li without tiring yourself is because you travel where there is no enemy. That you are certain to take what you attack is because you attack a place the enemy does not or can-not protect.*

虚 weakness

- 不强 not strong
- 不守 not well-defended
- 不备 unprepared





(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

- 攻势防御 offensive defense
- 进攻顶点 Culminating point of attack
- 民众武装 armed citizens
- 打击重心 strike the centre of gravity





(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

◆ 攻势防御 offensive defense

防御是由巧妙打击组成的盾牌

Defense is a shield composed of delicate strikes.

如果防御者采取的是积极防御，他在其他地点向我们进攻，那么，我们除了在毅力和胆量方面超过他以外，就没有其他办法取得胜利。

If the defender adopted active defense, and when they attack us from other positions, we will have no other methods to win but for perseverance and courage.





(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

- ◆ 进攻顶点
- ◆ Culminating point of attack

大多数战略进攻只能进行到它的力量还足以进行防御以等待媾和的那个时刻为止。超过这一时刻就会发生剧变，就会遭到还击，这种还击的力量通常比进攻的力量大得多。

Most strategic attack can persist till it is still capable of defense and awaits for peace talk. When going beyond such moment, there would be dramatic change and we will encounter counterattack, which will be stronger than attack.





在攻防问题上，“兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

- ◆ 民众武装
- ◆ armed citizens

民众武装象暗中不断燃烧着的火焰一样破坏着敌军的根基。.....一个国家所遭受的失败无论多么惨重，仍然必须利用军队向本国腹地的退却来发挥要塞和民众武装的作用。

The armed civilians are like burning flame in darkness, destroying the foundation of enemy. No matter how serious failure a country suffered, the country should still retreat to the hinterland and give into full play the roles of fortification and civilian troops.





(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

◆ 打击重心

◆ strike the center of gravity



军队中也有重心，这种重心的运动和方向对其他各点起着决定性的作用。There is also center of gravity in military. The movement and direction of such gravity is decisive to other directions and points.

有两个主要原则贯穿在整个战争计划之中，并且是其余一切的准绳。There are two principles throughout the whole operational plan. And they are the criteria of all others.

第一个主要原则是把敌人的力量归结为尽可能少的几个重心，如果可能，归结为一个重心。就是尽可能集中地行动；第二个主要原则是尽可能迅速地行动。The first principle is to group the enemy into least center of gravities. If possible, group them into one center of gravity. Carry out concentrated actions. The second principle is to take rapid actions.



(二) “兵贵胜不贵久”与“攻势防御”

| 孙子Sun Zi | 克劳塞维茨Clausewitz |
|-------------------------|---------------------------|
| 一鼓作气 quick and decisive | 坚韧 firm |
| 主动 being active | 等待 awaiting |
| 以时间求空间 time for space | 以空间换时间 Space for time |
| 以强击弱 Strong vs. weak | 以强敌强 Strong vs. strong |



(三) 在信息问题上, “知彼知己” 与 “战争阻力”
C. In terms of information, “know the enemy and know yourself”
vs. “friction of war”



(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

知彼知己者，百战不殆；不知彼而知己，一胜一负；不知彼，不知己，每战必殆。 *Know the enemy and know yourself, and you can fight a hundred battles with no danger of defeat. When you are ignorant of the enemy but know yourself, your chances of winning and losing are equal. If ignorant both of your enemy and of yourself, you are sure to be defeated in every battle.*

情报是我们一切想法和行动的基础。

Information is the foundation of all our ideas and actions.

如何做到知？

How to acquire information?

不能尽知时怎么办？

If one cannot acquire abundant information?



(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

战争可知 wars can be known.

知彼知己，胜乃不殆；知天知地，胜乃不穷。

明君贤将，所以动而胜人，成功出于众者，先知也。

Know the enemy and know yourself, and your victory will never be endangered; know the weather and know the ground, and your victory will then be complete.

the reason that the enlightened sovereign and the wise general conquer the enemy whenever they move and their achievements surpass those of ordinary men is that they have foreknowledge.





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

隐真示假 conceal the real and expose the false

兵者，诡道也。

能而示之不能，用而示之不用。

.....

All warfare is based on deception.

Therefore, when able to attack, we must pretend to be unable; when employing our forces, we must seem inactive;





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

战场侦察 battlefield reconnaissance

不知诸侯之谋者，不能豫交；不知山林、险阻、沮泽之形者，不能行军；不用乡导者，不能得地利。

One who is not acquainted with the designs of his neighbors should not enter into alliances with them. Those who do not know the conditions of mountains and forests, hazardous defiles, marshes and swamps, cannot conduct the march of an army. Those who do not use local guides are unable to obtain the advantages of the ground.





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

善用间谍 good at using spies

三军之事莫亲于间，赏莫厚于间，事莫密于间。

Hence, of all those in the army close to the commander, none is more intimate than the spies; of all rewards, none more liberal than those given to spies; of all matters, none is more confidential than those relating to spying operations.





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

战争迷雾Mist of war

战争中行动所依据的情况有四分之三好象隐藏在云雾里一样，是或多或少不确实的。3 quarters of information in war on which battles are relied are like being hidden in clouds and mists. More or less they are not certain.





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

战争锻炼 war experience

有没有减轻战争阻力的润滑油呢？有，只有一种，而且它不是统帅和军队想得到就可以得到的，那就是军队的战争锻炼。

Are there lubricants to lift the friction of war? Yes, there is one. And it is not easily acquired by commanders and troops. It is the experience of war.





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

战争冒险 risks of war

战争近似于赌博！ War is
like gambling!

在战争中不冒险就将一事无成；战争的性质根本不允许人们经常看清楚前进路上的一切。

In war, if no risks, one can achieve nothing. The nature of war does not allow people to see clearly what is in front of them on the way.





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

战略预备队 Strategic reserves

在战略范围，也可能需要准备一定的兵力以防意外，因此，也可能需要有战略预备队。

In strategic field, there must be some reserves for unexpected incidents. Therefore, strategic reserves are possibly needed.





(三) “知彼知己”与“战争阻力”

| 孙子Sun Zi | 克劳塞维茨Clausewitz |
|------------------|-----------------|
| 可知 perceptible | 难知hard to know |
| 欺骗deception | 锻炼experience |
| 侦察reconnaissance | 储备storage |
| 探秘 explore | 冒险 risk |



二、两书的特征差异

II. A comparison of features



(一) 有限战理论与总体战理论

(二) 求最优理论与求最狠理论

(三) 精确化战略与概率化战略

(四) 间接性战略与直接性战略

A. Limited war vs. total war

B. Opt for the best vs. the toughest

C. Precise approach vs. probable approach

D. Direct approach vs. indirect approach



(一) 有限战理论与总体战理论

A. Limited war vs. total war



目的有限 limited aim

兵力有限 limited forces

时间有限 limited time

空间有限 limited space

节制

With restraint

“不” (228字) “bu (no)” --- 228 times

“非” (20字) “fei (not)” ---20 times

“no” --- 504 times

“not” ---256 times





自从拿破仑出现以后，战争首先在作战的一方，尔后又在另一方变成全体人民的事情，于是战争获得了完全不同的性质，或者更正确地说，战争已十分接近其真正的性质，接近其绝对完善的形态。战争中使用的手段已经没有明显的限制，这种限制已经消失在政府及其臣民的干劲和热情之中。

Ever since Napoleon, war first became the thing of all citizens of one side and later that of the other side. Hereinafter, war acquired a totally different nature. Or to be more exact, war is close to its real nature and relative perfect model. There are nearly no distinct limitations in the means used in a war. Such limitations were submerged in the enthusiasm of the government and its citizens.





克劳塞维茨应该对两次世界大战的爆发负有间接的责任。

Clausewitz should be held indirect
responsibility for the outbreak of two world wars.

——利德尔·哈特

Lidell Hart



(二) 求最优理论与求最狠理论

B. Opt for the best vs. the toughest



- 最小的伤亡 minimum casualty
- 最少的危险 minimum danger
- 最巧的行动 most subtle action
- 最大的胜利 maximum victory

“善” (33字) “best” 33 times

“全” (10字) “complete” 10 times





- 暴力更强
- More violent
- 兵力更多
- More forces
- 规模更大
- Bigger scale
- 意志更坚
- Stronger will



(三) 精确化战略与概率化战略

C. Precise approach vs. probable approach



夫未战而庙算胜者，得算多也；未战而庙算不胜者，得算少也。多算胜少算，而况于无算乎！吾以此观之，胜负见矣。 Now, the commander who gets many scores during the calculations in the temple before the war will have more likelihood of winning. The commander who gets few scores during the calculations in the temple before the war will have less chance of success. With many scores, one can win; with few scores, one cannot. How much less chance of victory has one who gets no scores at all! By examining the situation through these aspects, I can foresee who is likely to win or lose.





战争的客观性质很明显地使战争成为概然性的计算

The objective nature of war has apparently turned war into a calculation of probability.





(四) 间接性战略与直接性战略

D. Direct approach vs. indirect approach



军争之难者，以迂为直，以患为利。

After that, comes tactical maneuvering, than which there is nothing more difficult. The difficulty of tactical maneuvering consists in turning the devious into the direct, and misfortune into gain.

- 模糊 vague
- 疲惫 exhausted
- 扰乱 disrupted
- 迂回 devious





(一) “不战而屈人之兵”与“消灭敌人军队”

有些仁慈的人可能很容易认为，一定会有一种巧妙的方法，不必造成太大的伤亡就能解除敌人的武装或者打垮敌人，并且认为这是军事艺术发展的真正方向。这种看法不管多么美妙，却是一种必须消除的错误思想。

Some humane people are likely to think that, there must be some delicate method that can disarm the enemy or overthrow them without too heavy casualty. And they thought such should be the real direction of military art. No matter how wonderful such idea looks, it must be eradicated.





战略上一切都很简单，但是不因此而容易。

Strategically, everything is simple but it does not mean they are necessarily easy.

统帅应该努力寻求计划中的主力会战，争取在能够获得决定性胜利的兵力对比和有利条件下进行主力会战。为了这个目的，统帅应该不惜牺牲一切，在围攻、包围、守备等方面应该尽量少用兵力。

Commanders should strive for decisive battles as planned. They should engage in such battles with favorable comparison of strength and favorable conditions. The generals should work to such end at all costs. And they should deploy less troops in siege, encirclement and garrison.

- 规则 rule
- 简捷 concise
- 消灭 disarm
- 决战 decisive battle





THANKS!